To Accreditation Council Of the Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care

## REPORT

# OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS OF THE ASSESSMENT OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME 7M10122 "MBA MANAGEMENT IN HEALTH CARE" OF NJSC "ASTANA MEDICAL UNIVERSITY" FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE ACCREDITATION STANDARD OF MASTER'S DEGREE PROGRAMME IN SPECIALTY "MBA MANAGEMENT IN HEALTH CARE", QUALIFI-CATION – MASTER OF BUSINESS ADMINISTRATION

period of external expert evaluation: 08/17/2021 - 08/20/2021

Nur-Sultan, 2021

	List of symbols and abbreviations	2		
1.	EEC composition			
2.	General part of the final report of the EEC			
2.1	Presentation of NJSC "Astana University of Medicine "			
	and the educational programme of the magistracy 7M10122 "MBA management			
	in health care"			
2.2	Information about previous accreditation	7		
2.3	Self-assessment report analysis Master's educational programme 7M10122 "MBA	7		
	health care management "			
2.4	General assessment of the master's educational programme 7M10122	8		
	"MBA health care management "for compliance with accreditation stand-			
	ards of the educational programme of magistracy in the specialty "MBA			
	Management in Health care" qualification - Master of Business Administra-			
	tion.			
3.	Description of the stages of external expert evaluation and conclusion	9		
4.	Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of ex-	15		
	ternal assessment of master's degree programmes 7M10122 "MBA management			
	in health care "NJSC" Astana Medical University "and an overview of the			
	strengths			
5.	Recommendations for improvement educational programme magistracy	26		
	7M10122 "MBA management in health care "NJSC" Astana Medical Uni-			
	versity "			
6.	Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council	27		
7.	Attachment 1. Quality profile and criteria for external assessment of the master's	28		
	degree programme 7M10122 "MBA management in health care" for compliance			
	with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards			
	Attachment 2. List of studied documents for the educational programme	29		

# CONTENT

# LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS:

Abbreviation	Decoding
NJSC "AMU",	Non-profit joint-stock company "Astana Medical University"
University	
AIS	automated information system
AMP	administrative and management personnel
SAC	state attestation commission
SCES RK	State compulsory education standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan
SEB	state examination board
ECAQA	Non-profit institution "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality
_	Assurance in Higher Education and Health care"
ITWP	individual teacher's work plan
ISO	International Organization for Standardization
IEP	Individual educational plan
CC	component of choice
CCSES MoN RK	Committee for Control in the Sphere of Education and Science of the
	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
(TBL)	team-oriented learning
QED	Catalog of elective disciplines
MoH RK	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
EFQM model	Model of Excellence of the European Foundation for Quality Management
MES RK	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
IS ISO	ISO International Standard
JSC	joint-stock company
AHSS	academic health and science system
IAHS	integrated academic health care system
EP	educational programme
QAC	quality assurance committee
PH	Public health care
CMDS	center for master's and doctoral studies
RA	research activities
QED	catalog of elective disciplines
IWS	independent work of students
ШЦЫЕ	independent work of a student under the guidance of a teacher
CA	case analysis
CTEDT	center for the transfer of educational and distance technologies
not	new educational technologies
SE	State exam
СРІ	key performance indicators
MBA	master of business administration
DBA	doctor of business administration
WC	working curricula
СМТ	control and measuring tools
MAC	medical advisory commission
CMAC	centralized medical advisory commission

### 1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 24 dated 03.08.2021, an External Expert Commission was formed to conduct accreditation of the educational programme of the specialty magistracy of NJSC "Astana Medical University" in the period 17-20.08.2021 (17-19.09 - online, 20.09.2021 - offline) in the following composition:



#### **Chairperson of the External Expert Commission** KUZGIBEKOVA ALMA BOLATOVNA,

Candidate of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Childhood Diseases, Karaganda Medical University, Honorary Worker of Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Accredited independent expert in assessing the quality of medical services.

tel .: +77017166694, e-mail: alma\_aks@mail.ru



#### Foreign expert RAKHIMOV BAKHODIR BAKHTIYOR ЎFLI, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Sanitary Doctor, Hygienist and Epidemiologist, Assistant at the School of Public Health of the Tashkent Medical Academy, Researcher at Koryo University Tel .: +821027584142, e-mail: rakhimov.bb@gmail.com



#### National academic expert

ZHANTURIEV BOLAT MEIRBEKOVICH Candidate of Medical Sciences, DBA, Head of LBT TCL TB of Almaty, NCEM&MD and MI MOH RK (Head of laboratory biological tests of the Testing Center with laboratories of the Territorial Branch of Almaty City of the National Center for Examination of Medicines and Medical Devices of the MoH RK)

tel .: + 7 707 3338089, e-mail: <u>bolatzhan@gmail.com</u>



#### National academic expert

ORANBAI LYAZAT ZHADIGERGYZY, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Head of the Department of Public Health with a course of hygiene and epidemiology, Head of the Residency Department of the National Educational Institution "Kazakh-Russian Medical University"

Tel .: 8 771 407 2466, e-mail: <u>Lorakbay@inbox.ru</u>



Expert - employers' representative KOZHEKENOV DINAT ERIKOVICH, Deputy Director of SPE on REM "Multidisciplinary City Children's Hospital 1", Nur-Sultan tel .: + 7 7018998156, e-mail: <u>Dinat\_86 @ ma il.ru</u>



Expert - representative of undergraduates (online) AUMOLDAEVA ZAURE MARATOVNA, 1st year undergraduate student in the specialty "Public Health" NJSC "Kazakh-Russian Medical University" tel .: +7 777 353 0621, e-mail: <u>zaumoldaeva@bk.ru</u>



#### ECAQA Observer

UMAROVA MAKPAL ALDIBEKOVNA, Head of the Accreditation and Monitoring Department, Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health care

tel :: +7 747 5609212, e-mail: <u>info@ecaqa.org</u>

The work of the EEC was carried out in accordance with the Regulations on the EEC (Order of the Director general of ECAQA No. 4 dated February 13, 2017).

The EEC report contains an assessment of the educational programme magistracy 7M10122 "MBA Management in Health care" NJSC "AMU", recommendations of the EEC on the further improvement of the educational activities of the university in the field of postgraduate education.

2. General part of the final report of the EEC

#### 2.1 Presentation NJSC "AMU" and educational programme of magistracy 7M10122 "MBA Management in Health care"

NJSC "AMU", the University was founded in October 1964 as Tselinograd State Medical Institute by the decision of the Central Committee of the Communist Party and the Council of Ministers of the Kazakh SSR.

Over the years of the existence of the Medical Institute, there have been multiple changes in its organizational form, reforming the management system in accordance with the requirements of the time. The main stages of the development of the University:

- 1. Tselinograd State Medical Institute (1964-1997).
- 2. Kazakh State Medical Academy (1997-2008).

3. Joint Stock Company "Kazakh Medical Academy", with one hundred percent participation of the state in the authorized capital (13.05.2008-2009).

4. NJSC "Astana Medical University" (06.01.2009-01.07.2010) as a part of JSC "National Medical Holding" (hereinafter - NMH).

5. NJSC "Astana Medical University" since 01.07.2010. is under the jurisdiction of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

From February 22, 2019, on the basis of the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On issues of creating a non-profit joint stock company" Astana Medical University "No. 648 dated October 16, 2018, the joint stock company" Astana Medical University "was reorganized into a non-profit joint stock company" Astana Medical University ".

Currently, the university has a state license of the Committee for Control in Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated January 31, 2009, No. KZ93LAA00014823, for an unlimited period, for the right to carry out educational activities under the programmes of higher and postgraduate professional education, according to which it has the right to issue documents on the education of the state standard.

According to the organizational structure of NJSC "AMU", the main structural divisions of the University are institutes, dean's offices, departments, departments, divisions, centers, which include staff in the following categories: teaching staff, administrative and managerial personnel, training and support personnel, service personnel, other personnel.

The documents that constitute the organizational and legal basis of the activities and the legal basis for the implementation of the educational programme of the University are presented on the website of the university <u>https://www.amu.kz/korparup/about\_the\_university/</u>

The University has a multilevel education system. 6118 students, 1572 interns, 914 residents, 96 undergraduates and 77 doctoral students' study at the faculties of the University, including 961 foreign students.

The university operates a system of international distance learning (MOODLE), which in its work uses the latest achievements in this area https://dl.amu.kz/

Since 2012, distance learning has been introduced at the level of additional professional education.

NJSC "AMU" was the first among the medical universities of Kazakhstan to begin multilevel training of medical and scientific-pedagogical personnel (system of continuous higher education) in the following areas: bachelor's degree - internship - residency; Bachelor's - Master's - PhD doctoral studies

In order to create conditions for continuous improvement of the university's activities and increase the satisfaction of the needs and expectations of its stakeholders, the University has been certified four times for compliance with international standards ISO 9000 versions 2000 and 2008 since 2007, uses management tools: strategic management, SWOT analysis, outsourcing, cleaning, benchmarking, balanced scorecard, project management, HR management, institutional accreditation standards of the university, laboratory accreditation standards ST RK ISO / IEC 17025.

In the Rating of educational programmes of universities / Health care and social security (medicine) / National Chamber of Entrepreneurs of the Republic of Kazakhstan "Atameken", the University was ranked in:

2018: first place in the specialties "Public Health", "Pharmacy" and "Nursing" in the specialties "General Medicine"; second place - "Dentistry".

2019: first place in the specialties "Pharmacy", "Dentistry"; second place - "Nursing", "General Medicine"; fourth place - "Public health".

2020: - second place in the specialty "Pharmacy"; third place - "Nursing"; fourth place - "Dentistry"; fifth place - "General Medicine";

According to the results of the MH RK rating assessment of the educational activities of medical universities at the end of the 2019-2020 academic year, NJSC "Astana Medical University" topped the overall rating with a value corresponding to the level of 5 stars (high level).

As part of the implementation of the state assignment under programme 031 "Implementation of international standards in hospital management", NJSC "AMU" also showed leadership and was the first to launch an educational programme for the preparation of "Masters of Business Administration" (MBA) in the field of hospital management.

Department of "Public Health care and Management", implementing the educational programme of the magistracy 7M10122 "MBA Management in Health care", which is headed by Candidate of Medical Sciences, Assoc. Professor Turgambaeva Asiya Kairbaevna.

Characteristics of the examined educational programme: an educational programme for the training of professional business managers for the health care system, capable of assisting in improvement to comprehensively solve the problems of managing the economy, finance, developing business elements and owning new management tools

Implementation level - Master MBA

Development period: 2 years

Development form: full-time

Graduate qualifications - Master of Business Administration in the specialty 7M10122 "MBA Management in Health Care".

#### 2.2 Information on previous accreditation

Accreditation of the Master's educational programme 7M10122 "MBA Management in Health Care" until now has not been carried out.

#### 2.3 Analysis of the self-assessment report of the Master's degree programme 7M10122 "MBA Management in Health care" until now has not been carried out.

Self-assessment report educational programme presented on 122 pages and contains 14 tables (not counting tables with SWOT analysis) and 11 annexes. A number of documents are presented on the corporate website<u>https://www.amu.kz</u> ... Attached to the Institutional Self-Assessment Report list members of working group on self-assessment and preparation for accreditation educational programme 7M10122 "MBA Management in Health care" with an indication of the responsibility of each member of the internal commission; information about the person responsible for the self-assessment for compliance with Accreditation Standards educational programmes ECAQA.

It should be noted that the OS as a whole is composed in a structured, logical, concrete, visual manner. The information is presented sequentially in accordance with the structure of the Standard and is illustrated by the appropriate tabular material, annexes and references, incl. on Internet resources. The language and style of writing is concise, simple and informative, which allows for the perception of information by both academic, scientific workers and undergraduates, employees of health care organizations and other interested parties.

The report is characterized by the completeness of answers to all 9 accreditation standards, structuredness, taking into account the recommendations of the ECAQA Self-Assessment Guidelines, as well as the internal unity of the information provided University.

The report is accompanied by a cover letter from acting Chairperson of the Management Board-Rector of NJSC "AMU" Dauletyarova M.A., confirming that in this self-assessment report of the educational programme 7M10122 - "MBA Management in Health care" NJSC "AMU" - Master of Business Administration ECAQA / ECAQA, the data provided is absolutely reliable, accurate and comprehensive data that adequately and fully characterize the above accredited educational programme

The report contains information about the representative of the NJSC AMU, responsible for the self-assessment of educational programmes - Kulmirzaeva A.B., head of the Center for Master's and Doctoral Studies.

Self-assessment of the educational programme 7M10122 "MBA Management in Health care" of the NJSC "Astana Medical University" was carried out on the basis of order No. 252-n /  $\kappa$  dated May 18, 2021 7M10122 "MBA Densaulyk saktaudagy Management " about conducting control ". On the basis of it, the composition of the internal self-assessment commission was determined according to the criteria of specialized accreditation, indicating the responsibility of each member of the internal commission. Under the leadership of those responsible for writing reports in the context of standards, working groups have been formed to write reports in accordance with the criteria of the relevant standards. The working groups for the preparation of the self-assessment report have done a certain amount of work: the content of the accredited educational programme, the conditions for its implementation, staffing, educational resources have been analyzed, the necessary information has been collected in accordance with the Accreditation Standards; a thorough analysis, updating and addition of methodological and educational materials was carried out, their content is reflected in the report. The content of the Self-Assessment Report is structured in accordance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards and includes a description of strengths, areas for improvement for each of the 9 standards. Each of the presented parts ends with a SWOT analysis that summarizes the material presented in the section.

Self-assessment of the educational programme was carried out based on regulatory enactments and strategic programmes for the development of health care and education in the Republic of Kazakhstan and is aimed at providing an integrated approach to the training of highly qualified competitive specialists in the health care system, their Continuing Professional development based on the integration of education, science and practice. It is worth noting that this EP "MBA Management in Health Care" is not new, a similar programme called "MBA in hospital management» µas taught earlier at the AMU.

#### 2.4 General assessment of the Master's study programme 7M10122 - "MBA Management in Health Care" for compliance with the Accreditation Standard of the Master's programme in the specialty "MBA Management in Health Care"

Based on the analysis of the self-assessment report by external experts, it was found that The content of the self-assessment report is structured in accordance with the ECAQA accreditation standards and the recommendations of the Self-Assessment Guidelines, at the same time, based on the results of the expert evaluation, recommendations for adjustments were made, which were taken into account by the authors of the report.

The report is written consistently in compliance with the logic in the description of the standards, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable, the tables contain references in the text, but do not have continuous and sequential numbering. There are links to regulations, model rules, regulations, teaching documents, website pages <u>https://www.amu.kz</u>...

The self-assessment and description were carried out in accordance with the criteria of the ECAQA accreditation standards and the questions formulated in the Self-Assessment Guidelines were answered. All standards provide practice IIIa NJSC "Astana Medical University" for the preparation of undergraduates according to the educational programme of the magistracy 7M10122 - "MBA Management in Health care" taking into account the beginning of the admission of students twice a year, well-reasoned data, examples of the implementation of the tasks of the educational programme, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. Self-assessment report description is fairly completed and updated in terms of the number of undergraduates, teachers, administration, information about the selection and admission, the results of training, the results of the assessment of knowledge and skills, the material and technical base of the university and clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, development plans and improvement, etc.

Conclusion on each of the nine accreditation standards includes a description of the strengths and areas for improvement identified in the course of introspection and the prospects for the development of these master's degree programmes.

Thus, the self-assessment report of the accredited master's degree programmes of the NJSC AMU contains objective, detailed, structured information on all activities in accordance with the ECAQA accreditation standards, and the university made the appropriate corrections in the report at the expert evaluation stage.

#### 3. Description of external expert evaluation

External expert work on the assessment of the master's educational programme 7M10122 - "MBA Management in Health care" of the NJSC AMU was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the external assessment of educational institutions and educational programmes of ECAQA (approved by the order of the Director General of the NJSC "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health care "No. 5 of February 17, 2017) and according to the programme and schedule approved on August 24, 2021 by the Director general of ECAQA Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed and deputy Chairperson of the Board-Rector of NJSC "AMU" Dauletyarova M.A.

To obtain objective information on the expert assessment of the accredited educational programme, the members of the EEC used the following methods: interviews with management and administrative employees, interviews with employees, observation, study of the website, interviewing employees of various structural units, teachers, questionnaires, review of resources in the context of implementation accreditation standards, study atChebical and methodological documents both before the visit to the university and during the visit.

To obtain objective information on the expert assessment of the accredited educational programme, the members of the EEC used the following methods: interviews with management and administrative staff, interviews with bachelors, observation, study of the website, interviewing employees of various structural units, teachers, questioning teachers and students, review of resources in the context of fulfilling accreditation standards, studying educational and methodological documents both before the visit to the university and during the visit.

The staff of NJSC "AMU" ensured the presence of all persons indicated in the visit programme and according to the lists of interview sites (Table 1).

Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants i	n meetings, interviews,
interviews with members of the EEC	

No.	FULL NAME.	Position
1	Dauletyarova M.A.	and about. Chairperson of the Board-Rector of NJSC "AMU"
2	Turgambaeva Asiya Kairbaevna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Assoc. profes- sor, head. Department of Public Health care and Management
3	Narmanova Oryngul Zhaksybaevna	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Public Health care and Manage- ment
4	Kerimbaeva Zakira Amirovna	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Public Health care and Manage- ment
5	Ibraev Serik Yeskendirovich	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Public Health care and Manage- ment
6	Saurbaeva Gaukhar Kairatovna	DBA, Department of Public Health care and Management
7	Dubitsky Andrey Andreevich	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Assoc. Profes- sor, Associate Professor of the Department of Public Health care and Management
8	Magzumova Raushan Ziyadinovna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Assoc. Profes- sor, Associate Professor of the Department of Public Health care and Management
9	Nakipov Zhandulla Balgabaevich	PhD, Associate Professor of the Department of Public Health care and Management

The sequence of the visit within 3 days is detailed in the Visit Programme, which is in the documentation of the accreditation center and in the Attachment to this report.

The first day of the visit is 08/17/2021 (online). An interview with the management and key employees of the AMU made it possible to determine the fulfillment of most of the criteria for accreditation standards 1, 2, 5, 7, 8, 9, namely, to identify approaches in developing the mission of the educational programme and its compliance with the strategic goals of the university, the role and place of higher education in clinical direction in the university's strategy (plan), mechanisms in determining clinical bases and qualified teachers, guaranteeing the adequacy of educational resources through planning public procurements and concluding agreements with country and international partners (more than 100 contracts).

Realizing that the accredited programme is relatively new, since the first admission of undergraduates is planned in 2021-2022, the experts studied in detail the educational programme for 7M10122 "MBA Management in Health care".

In accordance with the visit programme of the EEC, a meeting was held with the director and the department of academic work, information was received on the organization of educational and meth-

odological work, ensuring control over the compliance of the HEI of the university with the requirements of State standards of higher professional, postgraduate and additional education and educational programmes, regulations of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic Kazakhstan, Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan; planning, management, control and improvement of organizational and methodological processes for the use of innovative educational technologies; organizing support for the professional development of a young teacher, coordinating the work of the School of Young Teachers,

The experts found that the university strictly adheres to the requirements of regulatory legal acts and SCES in the implementation of educational programmes, and the management systematically monitors this process during internal audits, the work of internal commissions and inspections (QMS, mutual control, control of the vice-rector for academic work, reporting, etc. etc.).

The conversation by the Chairperson of the Quality Assurance Committee of NJSC "AMU", Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs allowed the experts to learn about approaches to attracting employees of clinical bases, medical organizations for teaching in the magistracy, about the strategy and tactics of recruiting students for different specialties, information security up to graduate education, and also identify problems for the management and development of human resources.

The conversation with the head of the center for international cooperation, the dean of the faculty, the head of the department of "Public health and management" made it possible to find out the real cooperation and its prospects with national and foreign partners, the peculiarities of integration into educational programmes. The role of international cooperation in the development and strengthening of training programmes was discussed.

An online meeting with employees of departments responsible for admitting bachelors (in other specialties) and undergraduates (according to the 7M10122 MBA Management in Health care programme) made it possible to deepen the understanding of the EEC members of how the government order is formed by specialties, the admission of bachelors, including those with disabilities, from so-cially vulnerable layers, work with departments, other structural units involved in the organization of the educational process. It should be noted that we will accept masters under the programme 7M10122 "MBA Management in Health care" is carried out only on a paid basis. The experts were familiarized with the materials on the admission of students and the selection of teachers.

Monitoring the employment of graduates, satisfaction with the quality of training of graduates of the EEC was discussed at a meeting with employees of the departments responsible for the employment of graduates of bachelor's and master's degrees. It is necessary to take into account the fact that graduation from an accredited educational programme 7M10122 "MBA Management in Health care" has not yet been, therefore it was not possible to interview graduates, however, the experience and authority of the AMU in training shows a high percentage of employment (> 90%) of graduates of other educational programmes of bachelor's and master's degrees, their demand by medical organizations throughout Kazakhstan ...

Interviews with faculty as providers of bachelor's and master's programmes "MBA Management in Health care" showed that there are good educational resources (a sufficient number of thematic patients, time for maintaining medical records, independent work of students) on the basis of the relevant departments. The experts received answers about the teacher training programme, the financing of this training, the availability of certification in teaching methods for teachers.

The second day of the visit 08/18/2021 began with an interview with members of the academic council, committee of educational programmes by levels of education (bachelor's, master's):

Ν	FULL NAME.	Position
0.		
1	Dauletyarova Marzhan Amangalievna	Chairperson of the Quality Assurance Committee of NJSC "AMU", Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs

2	Marina Morenko, MD, DSc, Professor	Chairperson of the Commission for Academic and Scientific Work of the Senate, Head of the Depart- ment of Pediatric Diseases with courses in allergol- ogy, hematology and endocrinology
3	Muldakhmetov Miram Seitzhanovich, MD, professor	Chairperson of the Quality Assurance Committee of the Faculty of Medicine, Head of the Department of Pediatric Diseases with courses in Pulmonology and Nephrology
4	Tarjibaeva Saule Kenesbekovna, Can- didate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor	Chairperson of the Quality Assurance Committee of the Faculty of Public Health, Associate Professor of the Department of Preventive Medicine and Nutri- tionology
5	Turgambaeva Asiya Kairbaevna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Assoc. professor, head. Department of Public Health care and Man- agement

The content of the meeting was planning, development, approval and evaluation of educational programmes, quality monitoring, representation of students in the approval and evaluation of programmes, analysis and quality of feedback study results.

The issues of planning the financing of the educational process (the proportion of expenditures on educational resources of the magistracy), interaction with the academic sector and departments, staffing, development of teachers was discussed at a meeting with representatives of the organizational and economic work sector, personnel department

Interviews with employers and representatives of practical health care were conducted online and included such questions as: knowledge of the mission of the university, participation in the development of the mission and proposals in the strategic plan, participation in the deliberative bodies of the NJSC AMU, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of students, teaching methods, knowledge assessment and students 'skills in the learning process, providing the department and students / undergraduates with the necessary resources for practical training and the formation of clinical thinking, about the problems of interaction with departments and universities in general, employment of graduates, etc. The employers' interest in the employment of university graduates was revealed.

EEC had the opportunity to assess educational resources when visiting the departments involved in the implementation of educational programmes: office-registrar;

center for the transfer of educational and distance technologies; center "electronic university".

The third day of the visit 08/20/2021. EEC worked offline. The assessment of educational resources was continued when visiting the departments involved in the implementation of educational programmes: the educational and clinical center and the center for support of publication and library services.

EEC visited the SPE on REM "Multidisciplinary City Children's Hospital No. 1", SPE on REM "Multidisciplinary City Children's Hospital No. 2", SPE on REM "Multidisciplinary City Hospital No. 3", Alanda Clinic, Institute of Radiobiology and Radiation Protection. At the clinical sites, experts surveyed the resources of the accredited educational programme, their compliance with Master's degree courses, accessibility for teachers and students, compliance with the needs of students, the university, and accreditation standards. It was found that the clinical / educational base corresponds to the goals and objectives of the accredited educational programme in the profile, management systems and standards, modern equipment and its availability to all students, and the department staff ensure collegial and ethical relations with the medical staff, the leadership of the clinical / training base to achieve the final results of the educational programme. Clinical sites have a sufficient number of training rooms equipped with multimedia. At clinical / educational bases, students are admitted to medical, financial

and economic documentation, work in various departments of medical and preventive organizations, participate in conferences, and analyzes of various managerial situations. Analysis of thematic management cases, work in small groups, presentation of management cases for analysis, participation in scientific and practical conferences and seminars is available in practical health care organizations for students. Before starting the relevant discipline of the educational programme, students receive a syllabus from the teacher and know what skills he must acquire and develop during training. The experts obtained evidence of compliance with accreditation standards 2 and 6, as well as validation of the information in the self-assessment report of the educational programme.

Due to the lack of recruitment for the specialty 7M10122 "MBA Management in Health care", interviews and questionnaires were not conducted.

In accordance with the NJSC AMU Visiting Programme, EEC members could hold meetings on the basis of the external evaluation on a daily basis. At the final stage of the EEC's work, a discussion of the results of the external assessment, study of documents, results of interviews, interviews, questionnaires were held. The members of the EEC started to design the final report of the EEC. EEC members made generalizations of the results of the external evaluation. The experts individually completed the "Quality profile and the criteria for external assessment of the NIC for compliance with the Accreditation Standards of the Master's Degree Programme in Medical Educational Institutions of ECAQA". No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the post-graduate education sector in general and the department implementing the accredited educational programme were discussed. A draft report with recommendations was prepared.

By the chairperson of the EEC prof. Kuzgibekova A.B. a final open vote on recommendations for the NJSC AMU and a final vote on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council were held. Then the chairperson of the EEC for the management and employees of the educational organization announced recommendations on the results of an external assessment within the framework of accreditation for educational programmes of the NJSC AMU.

#### **Results of the survey.**

An observer from ECAQA on August 16-17, 2021 conducted an online survey of AMU teachers on the resource <u>https://webanketa.com</u>

In total, 141 AMU teachers were questioned, and 73.05% had more than 10 years of experience.

58.57% of the teaching staff are satisfied with the organization of the educational process, 31.21% partially agree. According to 71.63% of respondents at the university, ethics and subordination are observed in relations between colleagues, teachers, management, 21.99% partially agree with this statement.

The organization of labor and workplace in this educational organization satisfies 62.41%, in part - 29.79%. 70.21% of the teaching staff agree that there is an opportunity for career growth and development of teacher's competencies at the university, 21.28% partially agree. 66.67% agree with the possibility of engaging in scientific work and publishing research results, 21.28% partially agree.

26.24% agree with the statement "I am satisfied with the salary," 22.7% partially agree. The work of the HR (personnel) service is fully satisfied by 56.74%, partially by 27.66%.

Over the past year, 82.27% of the teaching staff have improved their professional competence. 46.81% of respondents are satisfied with the necessary material resources and infrastructure, 40.43% are partially satisfied. 70.21% have the opportunity to realize themselves in a university as a professional in their specialty, 19.86% partially agree.

63.83% of the teaching staff took part in the development of the educational programme in the discipline. The organization of education supports the participation of teaching staff in conferences (international, republican) in 20.57%; 25.53% of the teaching staff do not consult the management about this; 37.59% were unable to answer this question. 51.77% of respondents believe that students have free access to patients at the clinical facilities of the university and to improve their practical skills. 43.26% of the teaching staff are familiar with the programme of social support for teachers, 36.88% are not informed about them. 51.06% of the respondents believe that the heads of the university

listen to the teaching staff regarding questions about the educational process, research and development, clinical work, 21.99% - could not answer this question.

For approval "Have you been personally involved in activities to prepare for the accreditation of educational programmes?" 29.08% answered positively, 9.93% were engaged in technical support, 16.31% formed sections of the self-assessment report, 18.44% collected information for appendices to the self-assessment report.

#### Conclusion on the basis of the external evaluation:

Members of the EEC have carefully studied and evaluated the main indicators of the accredited educational programme 7M10122 "MBA Management in Health care". The information obtained by external experts during the study of the self-assessment report, preparation of a written review with recommendations for improvement, implementation of the activities of the visit programme of the NJSC AMU was analyzed. All the information received was compared with the data of the self-assessment report, which made it possible to make sure of the reliability of the information provided by NJSC AMU and supporting documents for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards.

Despite the fact that in the self-assessment report of the educational programme, the AMU described its best practice in compliance with accreditation standards, during the external expert evaluation, the EEC members studied the main documents (mission, strategic plan 2019 - 2023 and 2020 -2024, EP 7M10122 "MBA Management in health care ", individual plans of teachers for the 2020 -2021 academic year, publications, certificates of teachers, personnel policy, the programme of the internal quality assurance system, resources for training were viewed directly on the clinical / training bases of departments (classrooms, office equipment available for students to work with literature, patient documentation, educational and methodological literature), which made it possible to identify the compliance of the educational organization with the basic accreditation standards.

When conducting an external examination, it was found that clinical / educational bases provide training at all levels of medical care (from primary health care to highly specialized) accredited educational programme, there is a sufficient number of clinical / clinical bases, of which were visited by experts 5. During the visit to clinical bases, educational resources available for training in the Master's degree programme in Health care Management.

The experts took into account the fact that the accredited educational programme 7M10122 "MBA Management in Health care" is planned for implementation during the 2021-2022 academic year. year, therefore, at this time there is no graduation of students. Nevertheless, the entire educational, methodological, personnel and resource base was assessed for compliance with accreditation standards. Through interviews with teachers and interviews with students, it was possible to determine their direct participation in the development (COPs, meetings of departments), evaluation of educational programmes (COP), decision-making on a number of key issues in the choice of clinical / educational bases.

At the same time, this substantiated the need for inclusion in post-accreditation monitoring, along with the implementation of the EEC recommendations, an analysis of the implementation of the criteria of Standard 9, an annual report on the contingent of students.

Recommendations for improving activities in the implementation of the educational programme for 7M10122 "MBA Management in Health care" for compliance with the Accreditation Standards, developed by the EEC based on the results of the expert evaluation, were presented at a meeting with the management on 08/20/2021.

The programme of the 3-day visit of the external expert evaluation of the EEC has been completed in full. On the part of the NJSC AMU staff, the participation of all persons indicated in the programme is ensured.

Thus, the external assessment and the visit of the EEC members made it possible to verify and validate the data of the self-assessment report of the master's programme in full in accordance with the Regulation on the External Expert Commission, Guidelines for external assessment of the ECAQA medical education organization.

For the work of the EEC, comfortable conditions were created, access to all necessary information and material resources of the accredited educational programme was organized. Experts note the high level of corporate culture and discipline of those responsible for the postgraduate education of the ICC staff, department, staff of clinical bases, a high degree of openness of the team in providing information to members of the EEC.

# 4. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of external assessment of educational programmes 7M10122 "MBA Management in Health care" and an overview of the strengths for each standard.

#### **Standard 1: MISSION AND OUTCOMES**

The team of the department implementing the master's programme as the basis of the mission of the educational programme and goals adopted the mission and vision of the university, which are reflected in the Strategic Directions of NJSC "Astana Medical University" for 2019-2023, approved by the decision of Protocol No. 7 of the Board of Directors dated 07.24.2019. and informed interested parties (teachers, employers, undergraduates) about it in order to clearly understand the tasks and strive to meet the needs of practical health care.

The mission of the University is to develop society by ensuring high quality education, science and clinical practice through the training of a new generation of medical personnel, modern science and the concept of the nation's health. In accordance with the mission of the university, specialists are trained at all levels of higher and postgraduate education in all areas of health care.

The mission of the EP in the specialty 7M10122 "MBA Management in Health Care" is to train professional business managers for the health care system who are able to assist in improving comprehensively solve the problems of managing economics, finance, development of business elements and own new management tools. It also complies with the current management system and policy in the field of quality assurance and is communicated to stakeholders in a concise and clear formulation that reflects its declared intentions, through publication on the university website, sent to corporate e-mail, discussed at department and other meetings. EP 7M10122 "MBA Management in Health Care" is compiled taking into account the achievements of medical research,

One of the main documents allowing to orient each member of the team towards achieving common goals, concentrating their initiative, enterprise, streamlining their business communication and ensuring a favorable moral and psychological climate is the University's Code of Corporate Culture and Ethics

Since the EP is focused on the expectations of the employer and the needs of the labor market, the elements of the EP, QED are coordinated with employers. Employers, members of professional associations are involved in reviewing the EP, participating in the discussion of the results at meetings of the CEP of specialties and the University. The established final learning outcomes of the programme are formulated in the EP in the specialty and are available for review on the corporate website of NJSC "AMU" in the section "Student", "Master student" and "Employer".

To improve all areas of the university's activities, including the mission, feedback monitoring has been introduced at the University. Feedback results are taken into account when planning improvement work. In general, the use of feedback contributes to a better understanding of the current needs of students and teachers and is systematic in making changes to the educational programme. An example of the effective use of feedback is the annual survey of employers and students to assess the level of satisfaction with educational programmes.

The experts received convincing data that the university is autonomous in making decisions in the development of an educational programme in terms of the elective component, the current and final assessment policy, including the choice of assessment methods (testing, oral questioning, clinical examination), selection and admission of students, personnel policy in relation to educators for the accredited study programme; and resource allocation.

Overall, Standard 1 demonstrates compliance.

#### Strengths:

a) There is a formalized mission of the educational programme 7M10122 "MBA Management in Health care".

b) The mission of the EP is based on the Mission and vision of the University, which are reflected in the Strategic Directions of NJSC "Astana Medical University" for 2019-2023, approved by the decision of Protocol No. 7 of the Board of Directors dated 07.24.2019. In accordance with the mission of the university, highly qualified competitive specialists of a new generation with a high level of professional competence are trained at all levels of higher and postgraduate education in all areas of health care, including in the speciality "MBA Management in Health Care".

c) The expected competencies of the undergraduates are described.

d) There is a relationship with the strategic direction "Customer-Oriented". AMU classifies the following groups as its main clients: state and society, students, patients, employers.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria**... In this standard, out of 4 criteria correspond: completely - 3, not completely - 1.

#### **Standard 1: completed**

#### **Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROCESS**

NJSC "Astana Medical University" carries out activities on planning, providing, monitoring, studying and evaluating, improving and ensuring the quality and integrity of the educational programme, the number of hours and the academic degree awarded. The University develops, approves, manages, regularly evaluates and revises its educational programme in accordance with the institutional policy, which is implemented by the relevant structural units, faculty and takes into account the stated mission and learning outcomes, and available resources. NJSC "AMU" implements an educational programme in the specialty 7M10122 "MBA Management in Health Care" based on the regulatory legal acts of the Republic of Kazakhstan: The State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan, standard and curricula, syllabuses of modules and disciplines

Competence in the specialty 7M10122 "MBA Management in Health Care" is formed as a result of consistent study of disciplines. Competence is, as a rule, interdisciplinary in nature. For this purpose, the content structure of each competence is determined, divided into disciplinary parts, relations of competencies and academic disciplines, practical sections involved in the formation of each competence.

The educational programme in the specialty 7M10122 "MBA Management in Health care" provides for the integration of the taught disciplines, both horizontally and vertically. The curricula of the integrated disciplines were developed according to the principles of continuous learning and logical sequence in the study of disciplines, the accumulation of educational achievements and integration.

The main task of educational programmes is to provide the student not only with mastering a certain amount of knowledge, but also with the ability to constantly acquire additional knowledge, in the context of the development of science, technical achievements and economic growth. This is aimed at the implementation of specific measures providing for the expansion of the use of design technologies and technologies of developmental education, training in the latest clinical developments.

The educational programme in the specialty 7M10122 "MBA Management in Health care" is developed and monitored with the participation of all interested parties / stakeholders. Specialty 7M10122 "MBA Management in Health Care" ensures the inclusion of representatives of undergraduates, employers, representatives of practical health care organizations, and graduates in the advisory bodies.

The participation of representatives of practical health care in the training of health care professionals occurs through their inclusion in the development of an educational programme, in the staff of departments for training, including the implementation of practice under the guidance of a mentor. Representatives of practical health care are constantly included in the certification and examination commissions. Cooperation with professional associations includes conducting guest lectures for students, holding round tables with employers on the compliance of educational programmes with the needs of practical health care, analyzing the State Educational Standard of Education by specialties with making proposals for supplementing and changing the content of educational programmes.

The staff of the department has the necessary competencies for training. The teachers of the departments use a variety of methods of active (business games, brainstorming, case studies, etc.) and traditional (oral analysis, mini-lectures) training, according to which staff members are periodically trained within the university, in other organizations (NCIE, Nazarbayev University, NJSC "MUK", etc.). The Department of Postgraduate Education is monitoring this.

There are no precedents of inequality, lack of ethics or other violations of a gender, cultural or religious nature in the process of external evaluation.

During the examination of the educational programme, it was established that the scientific foundations and methodology of medical research, evidence-based medicine are applied.

Overall, Standard 2 demonstrates compliance.

#### Strengths:

a) student-centered learning is reflected in the organization of the entire educational process;

b) the educational institution has the opportunity to provide the student with an independent choice of elective disciplines, contributing to his individual development in a given direction. Disciplines are developed by departments in accordance with the strategy of the university and the wishes of the students;

c) the topic of the upcoming research is also formulated by the student independently (if necessary, together with the scientific advisor);

d) the continuity of the process of self-education of students, aimed at the formation of professional mobility and the development of managerial skills, the disclosure of creative potential, individual abilities and the formation of personality, is also ensured by participation in conferences organized at the university;

e) the principle of implementation of 3 key points in training in MBA programmes is observed: the development of individual and group responsibility, the use of tasks that connect and mutually reinforce individual, group work and discussion in the classroom, the use of clinical situations.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Out of 6 criteria of the standards conform: fully - 3, partially - 3.

### Standard 2: completed

#### **Recommendations:**

1) Continue marketing research and studying feedback from stakeholders to determine an additional target audience, the requirements of "ultimate beneficiaries", identify the medical market's need for knowledge, skills, abilities and competencies of future graduates of the programme, as well as the priorities of these requirements, etc.

#### Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF STUDENT LEARNING

All information about the assessment policy, assessment methods, including assessment criteria, criteria for passing exams, weight and criteria for student progress, the appeal procedure, the number of allowed retakes and conditions for retaking the exam, is contained in the "Academic policy of NJSC" AMU "P-AMU-17-20, which determines the procedure for organizing training at the University for programmes of higher and postgraduate education. The document includes a policy in the field of quality assurance, rules for admission of applicants, internal regulations for students, a rating system for assessing educational achievements of students, final certification of students, rules for organizing and conducting repeated visits to classes of students, as well as other requirements for the educational process.

Each student, upon admission to the University, is familiar with the "Academic Policy" and the "Code of Academic Integrity" of the University. These documents, in order to provide free access to both students and all interested parties, are available on the official website of the University (<u>https://www.amu.kz/info/resident\_graduate\_doctoral/Masters-programme/ForMasterStudents/RegulatoryDocuments/</u>).

Methods and practices of control and assessment of knowledge are set out in the regulation PL-AMU-13-20 "On the conduct of intermediate and final certification of students of NJSC" AMU ". Assessment is carried out for all key final results and for all types of activities and is carried out at the university through midterm control, differentiated credits, intermediate and final controls for disciplines / modules of the specialty curriculum in accordance with the working curriculum. During the entire period of study of disciplines, various types of work are assessed, provided by the syllabus of the discipline. When developing control measures and methods for their assessment, the specificity, volume and educational and pedagogical principles of teaching the discipline are taken into account.

In order to improve information services for all subjects of the educational process, in accordance with the requirements for educational institutions, in Since 2013, the University has introduced AIS "Sirius".

The educational process of the university provides for a differentiated point-rating assessment of knowledge, reflecting the final result of training and the level of training of students in accordance with the requirements of the State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Responsibility for the policy for assessing the knowledge and skills of students is borne by all relevant structural units of the university. The general criterion for assessing knowledge is a curriculum based on state educational standards and establishing the amount of knowledge, abilities and skills.

In the development of assessment criteria and in the assessment procedure, the main principles are: consistency, variability, awareness, accessibility.

The assessment of the educational achievements of undergraduates covers the assessment of key competencies, and the assessment tools themselves are developed by departments / modules - control questions, tasks in test form, a list of practical skills, situational tasks, clinical (practical, managerial) situations.

A master's thesis is an independent study containing theoretical and (or) experimental results that allow solving an applied problem of an urgent problem of the studied specialty, carried out under the guidance of a scientific advisor. The topic and the supervisor are approved at a meeting of the department, then at a meeting of an interdepartmental meeting within three months after enrollment.

Requirements for the writing and execution of a master's thesis are reflected in the regulation "On training in the magistracy of NJSC" AMU "PL-AMU-121 and the working instruction" Requirements for the content, design and defense of a master's thesis "RI-AMU-18.

A master student who has mastered the theoretical component of the EP and successfully passed the preliminary defense procedure can be admitted to the procedure for the official defense of the master's thesis. According to the State Educational Standard, the main results of a master's thesis are presented in at least one publication and (or) one presentation at a scientific and practical conference. In order to present his work for the defense, he submits an attestation file to the CM&D, including the documents presented in "On training in the magistracy of NJSC" AMU "PL-AMU-121. During the procedure for defending a dissertation, leading specialists of practical health care, representatives from the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan and teachers of other medical universities are involved in the SAC. This approach ensures the validity, transparency, independence of the assessment of competencies.

Innovative (interactive) assessment tools introduced into the educational process include standard tests with an additional creative task, rating system of assessment, case method, presentation, discussion, completed project, critical analysis of articles, portfolio, project method, business game, combined lecture, self-assessment and assessment of classmates during work in small groups and conducting PBL, TBL. When evaluating written works studying at the University, the "Antiplagiat" system is used.

The University conducts a survey to organize feedback, to identify the needs of stakeholders, to study the quality of education processes, improve and improve the activities of all departments of the university. The survey procedure is carried out systematically throughout the entire period of study, consists of a survey of teaching staff, students, graduates, parents of students, employers. The questionnaires can be of different types, depending on the category of respondents. According to the internal

document SU-AMU-21 "Feedback Monitoring" monitoring and analysis of satisfaction and perception of the main consumers is carried out.

Overall, Standard 3 demonstrates compliance.

#### Strengths:

a) The principles, methods and practices for evaluating undergraduates have been identified and described.

b) There is a comprehensive grading system.

c) There is feedback from undergraduates

d) The quality of the rating system is maintained.

f) The system of training business managers is ready to adapt to changing conditions and changes in existing regulatory legal acts, the emergence of a new legislative field, renewal and restructuring of the management industry

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Out of 4 criteria of the standards conform: fully - 3, partially - 1.

#### **Standard 3: completed**

#### **Standard 4: STUDENTS**

Admission to NJSC "AMU" for the educational programme 7M10122 "MBA Management in Health Care" is carried out on the basis of regulatory legal and internal regulatory acts. On the corporate website of NJSC "AMU" (<u>https://www.amu.kz/info/Admissions-Committee/For-applicants/</u>), as well as on official social networks (<u>https://www.facebook.com/MeduniverAstana/</u>; <u>https://www.insta-gram.com/amu\_AMU\_official/</u>) reflects the selection process starting with the acceptance of applications, the criteria for the selection stage and enrollment for each educational programme.

According to the mission of NJSC "AMU", the training of competitive specialists for health care is the main activity of the university, and the admission policy is aimed at selecting the best candidates for the master's degree. The policy and criteria for admission to the magistracy of NJSC "AMU" are regulated in accordance with the regulatory documents of the Republic of Kazakhstan

The number of admitted undergraduates is planned taking into account the total area of classrooms, the availability of the teaching staff, the availability of educational, methodological and scientific literature, the throughput capacity of the university's practical bases, the availability of social and living conditions for the training of undergraduates. Information about the beginning of the admissions committee is available to everyone on the university website<u>https://www.amu.kz</u> ...

NJSC "AMU" renders assistance and support to the activities of undergraduates: undergraduates are provided with study premises with office furniture, their maintenance, access to wireless Internet, a library, and medical services. The effectiveness and efficiency of support services is carried out through reports, internal audits, performance evaluation and consideration of issues at meetings of collegial management bodies.

The University has a center for youth and sports, 18 student organizations led by students, whose activities are aimed at conducting a social adaptation and support programme for students. Students receive medical services at the AMU medical center. In order to promote and agitate a healthy lifestyle, students participate annually in the Competitions for the Rector's Cup, the University Cup in 16 sports and the mass race "MUARUN"

The school of supervision and mentoring is actively functioning. For undergraduates, services are actively working on the organization of advisory, psychological, social, legal and other types of assistance to support students.

Representation of undergraduates is provided in all collegial bodies of the University. Overall, Standard 4 demonstrates compliance.

#### Strengths:

a) The selection and admission policy are in accordance with the current legislation and the Charter of the University. Admission rules are approved by the Board of the University. The Admission

Rules are updated when the regulatory documents are changed, on the basis of which these rules are developed.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Out of 6 criteria of the standards conform: fully - 4, partially - 2.

#### **Standard 4: completed**

#### **Standard 5: STAFFING**

The personnel policy of NJSC "AMU" is reflected in the documents: Personnel policy approved by the decision of the Management Board dated 20.08.2020 No. 23 and in the "Internal Labor Regulations of NJSC" AMU ". The Department of Internal Administration carries out the current procedures for the admission, registration, dismissal of teaching staff and employees. The recruitment of teachers is carried out through a competition for filling vacant positions of teaching staff, the procedure for which is regulated by the Rules for competitive replacement of positions of teaching staff and scientific workers of NJSC "AMU". The selection and placement of scientific and pedagogical personnel is carried out by concluding labor contracts in accordance with the rules of the current legislation.

The number of the teaching staff is established in accordance with the staffing table of the university. At the beginning of the academic year, the staffing of the departments is approved. The balance of the academic staff of teachers of basic biomedical disciplines, behavioral, social and clinical sciences is observed, which contributes to the implementation of the educational programme in the specialty 7M10122 "MBA Management in Health care". The qualification level of the teaching staff corresponds to the positions held. There are personal files with information about the employee, certificates of compliance with the required specialty and the level of scientific training in the relevant field of knowledge. The qualifications of teachers are confirmed by an appropriate academic degree, academic title, experience, professional experience and trust of colleagues, and monitoring of the responsibilities of teachers of all disciplines of the educational programme is ensured. The qualifications and potential of teachers are correspond to the direction of the educational programme being implemented and the level of their positions.

To improve the effectiveness of students' learning, classes are conducted using interactive teaching methods. The AMU conducts a rating assessment of the teaching staff for all types of activities in accordance with the Regulations "On the rating for educational, scientific and clinical activities of the teaching staff of NJSC" Astana Medical University ".

The system of advanced training is carried out in accordance with the Development Programme of the teaching staff of the NJSC Astana Medical University for 2017-2021. and the annual plan of professional development of the teaching staff of NJSC "AMU".

Overall, Standard 5 demonstrates compliance.

#### **Strengths:**

- a) Availability of formalized procedures for the admission of teaching staff.
- b) Existence of a policy on the responsibilities of teaching staff.
- c) Within the framework of the teaching staff Development Programme for 2017-2021. identified key competencies for AMU employees.
- d) The constant development of the pedagogical competence of employees and control over their professional development is supported.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Out of 4 criteria of the standards conform: fully - 2, partially - 2.

**Standard 5: completed** 

#### Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES, SETTINGS AND SCHOLARSHIP

The successful implementation of the 7M10122 "MBA Management in Health care" is enabled by a high level of material and technical equipment, a sufficient number of clinical and research medical units and bases, simulation and interactive classes. The main clinical / production bases are: SPE on REM "City polyclinic No. 10"; RSE "Hospital of the Medical Center of the Administrative Department of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan"; SPE on REM "City Children's Hospital No. 1"; SPE on REM "City Center for Mental Health"; SPE on REM "Multidisciplinary Medical Center"; SPE on REM "City polyclinic No. 6", medical organizations in accordance with related disciplines, including polyclinics in Nur - Sultan. During the period of study, undergraduates have the opportunity to obtain, master comprehensive skills in the field of management and related disciplines with the practical assimilation of the provision of management services in a hospital, a polyclinic and other medical organizations. The University has signed agreements on joint activities with 54 medical organizations located in Nur-Sultan.

The learning environment, including the necessary material, technical and information resources, corresponds to the objectives of the educational programme. For the efficient operation of the infrastructure, the modernization of the software and hardware is being carried out. All students have access to the relevant necessary documentation, equipment; study rooms are equipped with personal computers, multimedia installations, office equipment. The book fund corresponds to the profile of preparation.

The university provides free access to undergraduates, teaching staff and staff to the Internet and Wi-Fi throughout the university, clinical / industrial bases. Information and communication technologies implement distance learning. Digitalization of educational and other processes is active. Students use electronic textbooks, multimedia presentations, electronic video lectures, training programmes, testing programmes, programmes for the formation of an individual learning path and schedule. The university provides access to high-quality information resources: EMBASE, JAYPEEDIGITAL, SCO-PUS, ELSEVIER, EPIGRAPH, SPRINGER, access to e-books and reference materials, access to electronic journals: MED info, MEDLINE, MedMir.com, the journal "Clinical Medicine of Kazakhstan", etc. The Antiplagiat programme has been introduced. The university has concluded contracts, memorandums of international cooperation and academic mobility. Information about international cooperation is posted on the university website.

The material and technical characteristics and potential of the university are a guarantee of its sustainability. In accordance with the Mission, goals and objectives in LLP KMU "VSHOZ", an analysis and a set of measures are annually carried out to improve the state of the material and technical base, as well as a number of actions to improve and introduce new trends in educational services based on information technologies.

Overall, Standard 6 demonstrates compliance.

#### Strengths:

a) Research activities are carried out by the teaching staff and students, taking into account the priority areas of medical science. Leading scientists of the university are both participants in the educational process and executors of scientific programmes, which ensures the logical unity of science and education.

b) NJSC "AMU" is a modern, rapidly developing University, which includes an institute, a research center, 22 laboratories and one experimental room (including 2 research and 20 educational laboratories), 65 departments.

c) Integration of scientific developments into the educational activities of the university ensures an increase in the quality of medical education, the competitiveness of graduates and university employees in the domestic and foreign labor markets.

d) The state of the material and technical base of the university and the equipment of its educational and laboratory fund allow to ensure the conduct of the educational process in accordance with the requirements of the current legislation and regulations.

e) There are information portals: AIS "Sirius" (edu.amu.kz), electronic library (bibl.amu.kz), electronic library catalog (kb.amu.kz), distance learning platform (dl.amu.kz) openlabyrinths (<u>http://olab.amu.kz:5181/</u>). It is planned to introduce AIS Platonus.

f) To conduct exams in the DOT mode, online proctoring technology is used, which allows you to verify the student, monitor the screen and student behavior, and record the entire exam on video.

g) The University has opened the Studio of a multimedia Electronic Textbook.

h) The University has been granted access to the Antiplagiat programme. University ", RF

i) In order to form and improve the digital skills of teachers, training activities are carried out using DOT. Training courses and instructions for teachers and students have been developed for preparing materials and posting them on temporary Internet channels: "How to create a YouTube channel correctly", "How to upload a video to YouTube", etc.

j) The university developed its own platform for the implementation of the MOOC "Massive Open Online Courses of NJSC" AMU "  $\,$ 

k) Access to modern information resources, such as the electronic catalog of the library fund, electronic databases is carried out through the local network of the university, available in all buildings and dormitories of the university

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Out of 2 criteria of the standards conform: fully - 2. **Standard 6: completed** 

#### Standard 7: MONITORING AND EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROCESS

The assessment of the EP of the specialty is carried out taking into account the mission and development strategy of the university, as well as the mission of the 7M10122 MBA Management in Health care programme itself. NJSC AMU has a programme for monitoring educational activities, processes and learning outcomes, including the routine collection of data on key aspects of the educational programme. The purpose of monitoring is to ensure the quality of the educational process, to identify areas requiring intervention. As part of the development of educational programmes, NJSC "AMU" has established mechanisms for the periodic review, study and evaluation of the implemented educational programmes, which ensures the quality of the programme management process. Study programmes are regularly reviewed and assessed by obtaining feedback from students, teaching staff and stakeholders, including employers,

Monitoring and evaluation of EP in the specialty 7M10122 "MBA Management in Health care" in NJSC "AMU" includes the following types of work: monitoring the provision of the educational process with the necessary resources (classrooms, clinical bases, teaching staff, educational literature, classroom fund, equipment, etc. .); monitoring the compliance of the curriculum with the requirements of state education standards; monitoring the compliance of the training content of students with the requirements of state educational standards, qualification requirements for specialists, professional standards, trends in the development of science and medicine; monitoring feedback from stakeholders on the quality of the content of the educational programme; monitoring student progress, progress in mastering the competencies defined in the programme.

The key figures in the monitoring and evaluation of the educational programme are specialized departments, a center for academic activity, a clinical activity center corresponding to a CEP, which work in close cooperation with students, practical health care and potential employers, the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The mechanisms of interaction with employers to ensure the quality of training under the Master's programme are participation in the assessment of the quality of training of graduates of representatives of potential employers in the framework of the state final certification. External assessment of the quality of educational activities under the master's programme within the framework of the state accreditation procedure is carried out in order to confirm the compliance of educational activities with the requirements of the state standard, taking into account the corresponding educational programme.

Monitoring of EP implementation is carried out within the framework of intradepartmental control (ICC) and intra-university control when attending open classes, lectures and other activities of the teaching staff to assess teaching methods and assess the knowledge of students. MAC is carried out by the staff of the department in accordance with the plan of the department. Monitoring of the educational process includes monthly meetings of departments, where they discuss the implementation of students' achievements, the results of quality control of the educational process. According to the regulatory documents, in order to increase the efficiency of the universities' activities, the Internal Audit Service has been introduced and is actively working in NJSC "AMU". Monitoring of EP implementation is also carried out within the framework of intra-university control and during internal and external audit of the teaching staff and students.

All stakeholders (teaching staff, students, employers) are involved in the programme evaluation process through representation in the relevant structures.

Within the framework of monitoring, the following are held: scheduled meetings of the management with students and university staff, general meetings; analysis of the survey of students, teaching staff, employers, graduates; analysis of complaints, wishes and reviews from health care organizations about teaching staff and students; analysis of scientific activities (quantity and quality of scientific products, quantity and level of scientific conferences, seminars, participation in grants, projects); analysis of the implementation of medical work (for clinical departments), taking into account the quantity and quality of the performed medical and advisory work; analysis of the results of the institutional rating of the university and the rating of educational programmes.

Overall, Standard 7 demonstrates correspondence.

#### Strengths:

a) A regular assessment of the EP is provided at meetings of the department with the participation of scientific leaders and students, taking into account the mission of the university, the interests of consumers and the requests of employers.

b) In order to monitor the quality of educational services and improve it, a systematic survey of students is provided.

c) For an independent and objective assessment of students, it is envisaged to involve representatives of practical health care as chairperson, members and examiners of the SAC for the final certification of graduates who participate in their distribution.

d) Constant feedback from trainers and teaching staff.

e) Educational participants can express their views on the EP by using trust boxes or the rector's blog.

f) Students are obligatory participants in conferences, seminars conducted by visiting foreign professors and teachers.

# **Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Out of 3 criteria of the standards conform: fully - 3. **Standard 7: completed**

### **Recommendations:**

- 1) Provide for the active involvement of undergraduates in the development and evaluation of EP.
- 2) Increase beats. weight of scientific publications in the field of general and applied management in medical and related fields

#### Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION

The management system of NJSC "AMU" involves all stakeholders, including the health sector, in the management process, and reflects the responsibility of the academic leadership. The university management system contributes to the achievement of mission and goals, maintains institutional efficiency and integrity, creates and maintains an environment for learning, research and creativity.

General management of the educational process and general control of all aspects of the implementation of accredited master's degree programmes at the university level is carried out by the head of the Center for Master's and Doctoral Studies (CMDS). The university administration and teachers are responsible for the quality of the educational programme

Academic and programme leaders are appropriately qualified as doctors of medical sciences. The university has administrative staff responsible for planning and implementation.

NJSC AMU has a clear range of responsibilities and authorities to provide the educational programme with resources, including a target budget for training. The university has the autonomy to allocate the resources necessary for the implementation of the educational programme.

The stable financial position of the university allows annually to allocate significant funds to improve the material and technical base.

On the basis of the principles of customer orientation, leadership of the management and involvement of all employees in the decision-making process, in the management system of the University, in particular, the management of the EP, collegiality of consideration of issues and decision-making is accepted. Several levels of collegial decision-making have been created

The results of academic activities, the effectiveness of modern forms of management of the educational process, the prospects for further improving management and improving the quality of education are considered and discussed in the final reports of the rector, vice-rectors and heads of key structural units at the annual traditional scientific-practical and educational-methodological conferences. To analyze the results and develop measures for improvement, internal commissions are formed (commission for competitive nominations, for holiday incentives, awards, expert commissions for competitions of scientific and technical progress of teaching staff and young scientists, etc.). The results of the commissions' work are heard at a meeting of the Senate and are the basis for measuring and improving the efficiency of the university as a whole.

The volume of funding over the past 5 years has a steady upward trend.

The procedure for organizing the system of remuneration, bonuses and social security of university employees is determined by the Regulations on remuneration, bonuses and social security of employees of the NJSC "Astana Medical University"

The basis for the transparency of the management and its decisions is corporate governance. Meetings of the Academic Council and other meetings are broadcast via the social network Facebook.

Overall, Standard 8 demonstrates compliance.

#### Strengths:

a) Responsibility for the implementation of the EP is borne by the CMDS together with the supervising department

b) To ensure an open discussion of problems and ideas for training undergraduates on the official website (<u>http://amu.kz</u>) The university has a blog of the rector for all students, once a year the rector meets with the contingent of university and postgraduate education, intern doctors.

c) NJSC "AMU" is an active user of social networks to provide an information field and a platform for communication with stakeholders.

d) The university allocates the budget in such a way as to ensure the possibility of conducting master classes on innovative technologies with the participation of foreign professors.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria**... Out of 11 criteria (criteria 2 and 3 were combined) of the standards conform: fully - 9, partially - 2

### **Standard 8: completed**

#### **Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL**

The management system of NJSC AMU is based on a value-oriented management structure capable of ensuring the achievement of the main goal of an educational institution - the implementation of educational programmes in the context of continuous changes. The university independently develops EP in the appropriate direction, level and profile of training, taking into account the needs of the regional labor market, traditions and achievements of the university's scientific and pedagogical school, in accordance with the National Qualifications Framework, professional standards and in agreement with the Dublin descriptors. EP are developed in accordance with the requirements of the State Educational Standard, reflect the learning outcomes, on the basis of which curricula are developed (working curricula, individual curriculum of students) and syllabuses for disciplines / modules.

The main function of the EP is the formation of competencies in future specialists in accordance with the requirements for learning outcomes and the implementation of the learning objectives declared

by the university. Further, the EP is discussed at the collegial bodies of the University, which include representatives of practical health care and students: Faculty Council; Specialty Quality Assurance Committee; University Quality Assurance Committee. The content of the EP is agreed with employers. The EP undergoes an external, independent review by expert evaluationers and, after making final adjustments, is approved by the Senate.

The implemented educational programmes are reviewed, studied, evaluated, which ensures the quality of the programme management process and determines the degree of interaction between teaching, research and training of the policy of ensuring the quality of programmes.

Updating the educational programme of disciplines is carried out taking into account the needs of employers and the labor market, as well as in accordance with new regulations. When developing and changing the educational programme with the participation of associations and employers, they are annually considered at an expanded meeting of the department, taking into account the interests of employers, adjustments are made to the EP and the content of the taught disciplines. Updating the EP is systematic, taking into account the interests of employers. The conditions for the effective promotion of a student along an individual educational trajectory in order to develop individual characteristics, needs and cultural experience of students meet all the requirements for the implementation of the EP.

In NJSC AMU, monitoring, performance evaluation, revision of the policy in the field of quality assurance of EP based on information management are carried out, depending on the requirements of the labor market and the environment. The implementation of the educational programme is based on the maintenance and development of the principles of academic integrity.

The process of constant renewal is carried out through the introduction of innovations and the use of information technologies, problem-oriented learning, the development of assessment methods, the organization of education based on competencies, the expansion of academic mobility, the revision of personnel policy, the improvement of the efficiency of operational processes and the transparency of the decision-making process. The curriculum is evaluated and validated, analyzing the degree to which teaching and research methods are in line with European requirements and the requirements of the national health system.

Monitoring of the application of the educational programme is carried out on the basis of the results obtained: academic performance, feedback on the basis of the questionnaire conducted, protocols of departments, reporting of divisions.

Constant renewal and improvement of all types of activities of NJSC AMU is based on regular and thorough study of models and trends of development and innovations in medical education in different countries. This is achieved by studying specialized literature, inviting international experts, applying the experience and skills acquired during the academic mobility of students, teachers and administration representatives in leading centers and medical universities in the world. Leaders of educational programmes, all interested persons have the opportunity to participate in conferences, seminars and trainings dedicated to the development of medical education, self-assessment and accreditation processes at the programme and institutional levels, quality Assurance in Higher Education.

Overall, Standard 9 demonstrates compliance.

#### Strengths:

a) In December 2016, the University successfully passed the 5th recertification audit of the management system and received the Certificate of the AFNOR body (France).

b) In April 2019, the University successfully passed national institutional accreditation (IQAA) and today the EP of all levels implemented by the University have passed specialized accreditation (certificate of institutional accreditation IA-A No. 0100 dated 04.22.2019)

c) The University has an effective system for monitoring the activities of the university. According to the internal document "Feedback Monitoring" SU-AMU-12, monitoring and analysis of satisfaction and perception of the main consumers (students, employers, teaching staff) is carried out.

d) The University has an approved Personnel Policy, the main task of which is formulated as getting the maximum return on investment in personnel by motivating each employee to solve the strategic tasks facing the University in the field of education, upbringing, science and innovation.

# **Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Out of 5 criteria of the standards conform: fully - 5. **Standard 9: completed**

Thus, all 9 accreditation standards have been met, no inconsistencies in the fulfillment of the criteria of each of the basic accreditation standards in the process of analyzing the self-assessment report and conducting the examination as part of the tasks of the external expert evaluation programme were found.

5. Recommendations for improving the educational programme of the educational programme 7M10122 "MBA Management in Health care" of NJSC "Astana Medical University":

- 1. Continue marketing research and studying feedback from stakeholders to determine an additional target audience, the requirements of "ultimate beneficiaries", identify the medical market's need for knowledge, skills, abilities and competencies of future graduates of the programme, as well as the priorities of these requirements, etc.
- 2. Provide for the active involvement of undergraduates in the development and evaluation of the educational programme.
- 3. To increase the proportion of scientific publications in the field of general and applied management in medical and related fields

#### 7. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

The members of the EEC came to a unanimous opinion to recommend the Accreditation Council to accredit the Master's degree programme in the specialty 7M10122 - "MBA Management in Health care" for a period of 5 years.

Chairperson Kuzgibekova Alma Bolatovna Foreign expert Rakhimov Bahodir Bakhtiyor ugli Academic expert Zhanturiev Bolat Meirbekovich Academic expert Orakbay Lyazat Zhadigerkyzy Representative of employers Kozhekenov Dinat Yerikovich Resident Representative Aumoldaeva Zaure Maratovna Observer from ECAQA Aldibekovna Umarova Makpal

O. deza

# Quality profile and external evaluation criteria (summary) of educational programme magistracy 7M10122 ''MBA Management in Health care» of NJSC AMU

			G	rade	
Standard	Criteria for evaluation		Significantly corresponds	Partially compliant	Does not match
1.	MISSION AND OUTCOMES 4	3	-	1	-
2.	EDUCATIONAL PROCESS 6	3	-	3	-
3.	ASSESSMENT OF STUDENT LEARNING 4	3	-	1	-
4.	STUDENTS 6		-	2	-
5.	STAFFING 4	2	-	2	-
6.	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES, SETTINGS AND SCHOLARSHIP 2	2	-	-	-
7.	MONITORING AND EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROCESS 3	3	-	-	-
8.	GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION 11	9	-	2	-
9.	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL 5 = 5/0	5	-	-	-
	Total: 45 = 34/11	34	-	11	-
				45	

Attachment 2

No	Inquiry		Confirming dat	ta of NJSC "A	AMU''
1	Inside the university document on the transition to DLT	2021 a	Order No. 360-n / k of 08/19/2020 on the organization of the educational process in the 2020- 2021 academic year. <u>1. Order 360 nk of 08/19/2020 on org. educational process in 2020-21</u> academic year.pdf		
2	Regulations on the design of dissertations and projects?	sis and	The working instruction "Requirements for the content, design and defense of a master's the- sis and project" was approved by the decision of the Board of NJSC "AMU" <u>2. Regulations</u> on the design of dissertations and projects		
3	Report of the admissions committee for the previous 3 years on the recruitment for paid ed-ucation	The contingent of those who entered the NJSC "AMU" (2018-2021) On a contractual basis: 2018-2019 - 215 applicants; 2019-2020 - 478 applicants; 2020-2021 - 458 applicants;			
4	The results of psychometrics of students who study in rural areas and in cities of the univer- sity		878 applicants for the 2019-2020 academic year and 2845 applicants for the 2020-2021 academic year passed psychometric testing on the basis of NJSC "AMU".		
5	15% of students participate in research, the ef- fectiveness of their participation. What departments do these students study in?	The ef	The effectiveness of students in research <u>5. The effectiveness of students in research</u>		
6	Ranking on the scientific process of the teach- ing staff for the last 2 years	teaching staff rating <u>6. teaching staff rating</u>			
7	The position where the recommendations of employers in the development of the imple- mentation of the EP are regulated	7. Review, University Standards: Feedback monitoring, Development of educational programmes			
	Regulations on the multisystem of the univer- sity (what number of teaching staff released video lectures)	No.	Development types	Quantity	Materials are posted on the Platform
8		1 2 3 4 5	Electronic textbook Thematic video lectures Practical skills training video Laboratory training video Audio lectures	15 589 617 12 84	https://amu.mbook.kz/ru/index/ https://dl.amu.kz/ https://dl.amu.kz/ https://dl.amu.kz/ https://dl.amu.kz/
			Interactive presentations	84 3814	https://dl.amu.kz/

		Working instructions for the development and organization of massive open online courses (MOOCs) in NJSC AMU " <u>https://www.amu.kz/info/em-ployee/ri_AMU/%D0%A0%D0%98-%D0%9C%D0%A3%D0%90-01-21%20%D0%A0%D0% B0% D0% B7% D1% 80% D0% B0% D0% B1% D0% BE% D1% 80% D0% B8% 20% D0% BE% D1% 80% D0% B3% D0% B2% D0% B6% D0% B0% D0% B8% 20% D0% BE% D1% 80% D0% B3% D0%</u>
		B0% D0% BD% D0% B8% D0% B7% D0% B0% D1% 86% D0% B8% D1% 8F% 20%   D0% BC% D0% B0% D1% 81% D1% 81% D0% BE% D0% B2% D1% 8B% D1% 85%   20% D0% BE% D1% 82% D0% BA% D1% 80% D1% 8B% D1% 82% D1% 8B% D1%   85% 20% D0% BE% D0% BD% D0% B8% D0% B0% D0% B9% D0% BD% 20% D0%
		BA% D1% 83% D1% 80% D1% 81% D0% BE% D0% B2% 20 (% D0% 9C% D0% 9E% D0% 9E% D0% 9A)% 20% D0% B2% 20% D0% 9D% D0% 90% D0% 9E% 20% D0% 9C% D0% A3% D0% 90.pdf
		Working instructions for the teaching staff on working in the distance learning system (RI-AMU-13-21) https://www.amu.kz/info/em-
		ployee/ri_AMU/%D0%A0%D0%98%20%D0%B4%D0%BB%D1%8F%20%D0%9F%D0%
		<u>9F%D0 % A1% 20% D0% BF% D0% BE% 20% D0% 94% D0% 9E% D0% A2.pdf</u> Developed working instructions for students (RI-AMU-12-21) <u>https://www.amu.kz/info/em-</u>
		ployee/ri_AMU/%D0%A0%D0%98%20%D0%B4%D0%BB%D1%8F%20%D0%BE%D0
		<u>%B1%D1 % 83% D1% 87% D0% B0% D1% 8E% D1% 89% D0% B8% D1% 85% D1%</u> 81% D1% 8F% 20% D0% BF% D0% BE% 20% D0% 94 % D0% 9E% D0% A2.pdf
9	Conclusion of the CEP on the comparative ef- fectiveness of teaching methods, possible Re- port with analysis	CEP Conclusions <u>9. Conclusions of the CEP</u>
10	Representation of students over the past 2 years in advisory bodies	Participation of students in collegial bodies <u>10. Participation of students in collegial bodies</u>
11	Research funding for the last 3 years	Science income <u>11. Funding for scientific research in the last 3 years</u>
12	List of undergraduates and students who partic- ipate in grant research	Projects with the participation of students of the AMU 2020 <u>12. Projects with the participa-</u> tion of students of the AMU 2020.docx
13	Confirming by publications of bachelors (30-40%)	Bachelor publications <u>13. Confirming by publications of bachelors</u>
14	Instructions for TB laboratory of the university	Safety briefing log 14. TB journal of sanitary and hygienic laboratories.pdf
15	Mechanism for informing students	Public awareness 2021 15. Public awareness 2021.docx

16	Employment of undergraduates (Observation reports for the last 3 years, the results of the study of feedback on employment).	Distribution PROTOCOL 2019-2021 Feedback from students <u>16. Employment in 3 years</u>		
17	Employment of bachelors (Observation reports for the last 3 years, results of the study of feedback on employment).	Employment of graduates (Reports for the last 3 years) <u>17. employment of bachelors in 3</u> <u>years.pdf</u>		
18	Feedback on the evaluation of educational pro- grammes (report)	Feedback from students 18. Feedback		
19	Regulations on the practice of undergraduates	Regulations on the organization of pedagogical, research and production practices <u>19. Regulations on the organization of pedagogical, research and production practice.pdf</u>		
20	Regulation on advisers /. Curator	Regulations on training in magistracy. Regulation on the activities of the adviser <u>20</u> . Regulations on adviser + Training in magician		
21	21 Syllabus for any discipline Syllables 21. Syllabuses			
22	EP for accredited programmes	Educational programmes for accredited programmes 23. WC on Hygiene and Epidemiology		
23	WC on Hygiene and Epidemiology	WC on Hygiene and Epidemiology 23. WC on Hygiene and Epidemiology		
24	IEPs of undergraduates	IEPs of undergraduates 24. IEPl of the undergraduate.pdf		
25	Topics from the DSHR	Topics from the DSHR 25. Topics from the DSHR		
26	How is the choice of ED and document (QEDs) carried out	The procedure for choosing an ED is spelled out in the regulation on the catalog of elective disciplines (paragraph 14 of the Academic Policy, page 25). QED OM 2021-2022.26. QED		
27	Analysis of academic performance before Covid-19 and in the context of distance learn- ing	The main indicators of student performance are AU (absolute progress) and KP (qualitative indicator), which, according to the results of the winter exam session 2020-2021 and 2019-2020. decreased slightly by 1% and 4%, respectively. We believe that such dynamics is associated primarily with the transition to DL and the existing technical problems. In this regard, the Faculty Council made a recommendation to provide the opportunity to live in a hostel and provide office equipment for students who do not have access to the Internet. Comparative analysis of academic performance shows that the lowest values of AU and CP are observed in 3rd year students in such disciplines as pathological anatomy and pathological physiology. The departments conducted feedback by means of questionnaires, Also, the programme of internal academic mobility is not being fully implemented, and the external one is reduced to zero, which, of course, is associated with the CVI pandemic. 27.Progress Report		

20	Attachments 1 and 10 to qualif. requirements	Attachments 1 and 10 to Qualitative Requirements No. 391 28. Appendices 1 and 10 to Qual-			
28	No. 391	ification requirements No. 391			